

GOOD ROADS EVERYWHERE: **A History of Road Building in Arizona**



prepared for
Arizona Department of Transportation
Environmental Planning Group

May 2003

Cover Photograph

U.S. Highway 66 at Gold Road, circa 1930s
Norman Wallace, Photographer
(Courtesy of Arizona Department of Transportation)

GOOD ROADS EVERYWHERE: A HISTORY OF ROAD BUILDING IN ARIZONA

prepared for

Arizona Department of Transportation
Environmental Planning Section
205 South 17th Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Project Number STP-900-0(101)
TRACS #999 SW 000 H3889 01D
Contract Number 97-02
URS Job 23442405

prepared by

Melissa Keane
J. Simon Bruder

contributions by

Kenneth M. Euge
Geological Consultants, Inc.
2333 West Northern Avenue, Suite 1A
Phoenix, Arizona 85021

revisions by

A.E. (Gene) Rogge
URS Corporation
7720 N. 16th Street, Suite 100
Phoenix, Arizona 85020

URS Cultural Resource Report 2003-28(AZ)

March 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

List of Tables	iv
List of Figures.....	iv
List of Pocket Maps.....	v
Foreword (by Owen Lindauer and William S. Collins).....	vii
Preface	ix
Abstract	xi
 Chapter 1 – Introduction.....	 1
ADOT’s Historic Preservation Challenges	1
Regulatory Considerations.....	3
Section 106, National Historic Preservation Act.....	3
Section 4(f), Department of Transportation Act.....	5
National Environmental Policy Act.....	5
State Laws	5
Organization of the Historic Overview	6
 Chapter 2 – Politics and Funding of American Road Building, 1776-1956.....	 7
Turnpikes, Railroads, and Military Roads	7
From Bicycles to Federal Aid	9
Bicycles and Mail	9
“The Roads Were No Good”	10
The U.S. Office of Road Inquiry.....	14
Good Roads and Highway Boosters	16
County and State Dollars	19
Federal Aid and the Seven Percent System.....	20
Numbering the Highways	22
Highway Appropriations During the Great Depression.....	23
War Traffic	26
The Road to the Interstate System	26
“No Boundaries”	27
 Chapter 3 – The Technology of American Road Building, 1776-1956	 29
Traditional Road Building Methods.....	29
The New Science of Road Construction	30
Asphalt and Concrete	30
Safety.....	31
Machinery.....	32
Comfort	34
 Chapter 4 – Building Roads in Arizona, 1846-1956.....	 35
Arteries of Travel, 1846-1956.....	35
Dirt Tracks: Arizona Wagon Roads, 1846-1909.....	36
Gravel Highways: Early Automobile Roads in Arizona, 1909-1927	41
Public Funds.....	42
Booster Highways.....	45
The Seven Percent System in Arizona	47
Asphalt and Concrete: Arizona’s Highway System, 1927-1956	49
Federal Dollars for the State Highway System	49
War and Recovery.....	55

TABLE OF CONTENTS (continued)

Policies and Politics: People Behind Arizona’s Road System, 1909-1955.....	56
J.B. Girand, Territorial Engineer	57
George W.P. Hunt, Governor.....	57
Laurence I. Hewes, Bureau of Public Roads.....	58
Charles C. Small, Civil Engineer	58
Fred McGuirey, Landscape Architect.....	58
R.C. (Cye) Perkins, State Engineer	59
Rough Terrain: Road Engineering and Construction, 1909-1956.....	59
Territorial and State Engineers, 1909-1927	59
Arizona Highway Department, 1927-1956	61
What’s Left?: The Archaeology of Arizona Roads	64
 Chapter 5 – On the Road: Five Case Studies	65
Beale Wagon Road	65
Historic Significance	65
Historic Integrity	65
Apache Trail, State Highway 88 from Tortilla Flat to Roosevelt Dam.....	70
Historic Significance	70
Historic Integrity	73
Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60, Superior to Claypool Tunnel	73
Historic Significance	78
Historic Integrity	78
Old State Highway 73.....	78
Historic Significance	83
Historic Integrity	84
Old State Highway 79 from Cottonwood to Flagstaff	84
Historic Significance	84
Historic Integrity	91
 Chapter 6 – Which Historic Roads Are Worthy of Preservation?	93
Some Challenges in Evaluating Historic Roads	94
Where Does It All End?	94
Long Roads, Short Dollars	94
The Spaghetti Problem.....	95
If It’s Old, It’s Eligible	95
All History, No Road.....	95
The Ubiquity Problem.....	95
The Process of Evaluating National Register Eligibility	96
Evaluating Significance.....	96
Criterion A	97
Criterion B	99
Criterion C	99
Criterion D.....	100
Assessing Integrity	101
The Seven Aspects of Integrity	101
Specific Aspects of Road Design and Workmanship.....	102
Assessing Potential Effects.....	104

TABLE OF CONTENTS (continued)

Chapter 7 – Conclusion and Recommendations.....	105
Historical Significance.....	105
Historical Integrity	110
The Next Step.....	110
References Cited.....	113
Photo Credits	121
Appendices	
A – Maps of the Arizona State Highway System, 1914-1946.....	123
A-1 Proposed State Highway System, 1914.....	123
A-2 State Highway System, 1918.....	124
A-3 State Highway System, 1924 (index to Maps A-3.1 to A-3.18.....	125
A-3.1 Map No. 1, Yuma-Phoenix Highway, 1924.....	126
A-3.2 Map No. 2, Phoenix-Globe-Rice Highway, 1924.....	127
A-3.3 Map No. 3, Rice-Safford-Duncan Highway, 1924	128
A-3.4 Map No. 4, Florence Junction-Tucson Highway, 1924	129
A-3.5 Map No. 5, Tucson-Bisbee-Benson Highway, 1924	130
A-3.6 Map No. 6, Bisbee-Douglas-Rodeo, New Mexico Highway, 1924.....	131
A-3.7 Map No. 7, Tucson-Nogales Highway, 1924.....	132
A-3.8 Map No. 8, Nogales-Fairbank-Tombstone Highway, 1924.....	133
A-3.9 Map No. 9, Phoenix-Wickenburg-Prescott-Ash Fork Highway, 1924	134
A-3.10 Map No. 10, Prescott-Jerome Highway, 1924.....	135
A-3.11 Map No. 11, Topock-Kingman-Ash Fork Highway, 1924	136
A-3.12 Map No. 12, Ash Fork-Flagstaff, Winslow-Holbrook Highway, 1924.....	137
A-3.13 Map No. 13, Holbrook-Lupton Highway, 1924	138
A-3.14 Map No. 14, Holbrook-Springerville-New Mexico State Line Highway, 1924.....	139
A-3.15 Map No. 15, Rice-White River-Springerville Highway, 1924	140
A-3.16 Map No. 16, Clifton-Mule Creek Highway, 1924	141
A-3.17 Map No. 17, Douglas-Pearce Highway, 1924	142
A-3.18 Map No. 18, Mesa-Chandler-Casa Grande Highway, 1924	143
A-4 State Highway System, 1930.....	144
A-5 State Highway System, 1935.....	145
A-6 State Highway System, 1941.....	146
A-7 State Highway System, 1946.....	147
B – Annotated Bibliography	150
C – Roads Listed in the National Register of Historic Places.....	153

LIST OF TABLES

1. Evolution of the Office of Road Inquiry, 1893-1956.....	16
2. Important Federal Road Legislation, 1893-1956.....	20
3. Toll Road Companies Authorized by the First Arizona Territorial Legislature, 1864.....	40
4. Mileage of State Highways in Arizona, 1921-1995.....	44
5. Largest Federal Aid Projects in Arizona, 1916-1926.....	45
6. Mileage of the State Highway System, 1927.....	49
7. Funding of State Highway Projects, 1917-1939.....	50
8. Definitions of Road Types.....	53
9. State Highway System, 1939.....	54
10. Road Mileage in Arizona, 1944.....	55
11. State Highway System, 1914.....	61
12. Highlights of Road Engineering and Construction, 1909-1956.....	62

LIST OF FIGURES

1. Growth of Automobile Ownership in the United States, 1900-1940.....	11
2. A Model T Ford in a Tucson Neighborhood, circa 1915.....	11
3. <i>Life Magazine</i> , 1907.....	12
4. <i>Life Magazine</i> , 1925.....	13
5. Trail and Highway Markings, 1925.....	18
6. Western U.S. Highway System, 1939.....	25
7. Mules in Arizona Road Construction, circa 1920.....	33
8. Major Arizona Wagon Roads.....	38
9. Early Two-Track Trail Through the Pines Near Flagstaff, circa 1910.....	41
10. Early Two-Track Trail Through the Desert, circa 1910.....	42
11. Major Arizona Highways.....	43
12. On the State Highway near Prescott after 1912.....	44
13. Ocean-to-Ocean Highway, circa 1912.....	46
14. On the Apache Trail below Roosevelt Dam, circa 1930.....	46
15. Gila River Bridge on U.S. Highway 80, circa 1927.....	48
16. Claypool Tunnel on U.S. Highway 60, circa 1932.....	51
17. U.S. Highway 80 near Yuma, circa 1930s.....	51
18. U.S. Highway 66 at Gold Road, circa 1930s.....	52
19. U.S. Highway 89 near Cameron, 1936.....	52
20. U.S. Highway 60 near Wickenburg, 1939.....	53
21. U.S. Highway 66 at Seligman, 1955.....	57
22. Roads Selected for Field Review.....	66
23. Beale Wagon Road Photograph Location in Kingman.....	67
24. Beale Wagon Road Photograph Southwest of Kingman.....	68
25. Segment of the Beale Wagon Road that Has Lost Integrity.....	69
26. Segment of the Beale Wagon Road.....	69
27. Apache Trail Photograph Locations.....	71
28. Segment of the Apache Trail.....	72
29. Segment of the Apache Trail.....	72
30. Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60 Photograph Locations.....	74

LIST OF FIGURES (continued)

31. Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60	75
32. Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60	75
33. Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60	76
34. Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60	76
35. Claypool Tunnel along Abandoned Segment of U.S. Highway 60	77
36. Old State Highway 73 Photograph Locations East of Cutter	79
37. Old State Highway 73 Photograph Locations North of San Carlos	80
38. Segment of Old State Highway 73	81
39. Segment of Old State Highway 73	81
40. Segment of Old State Highway 73	82
41. Segment of Old State Highway 73	82
42. Old State Highway 79 Photograph Location between Cottonwood and Sedona	85
43. Old State Highway 79 Photograph Location in Sedona	86
44. Old State Highway 79 Photograph Location in Lower Oak Creek Canyon	87
45. Old State Highway 79 Photograph Locations in Middle Oak Creek Canyon	88
46. Segment of Old State Highway 79	89
47. Segment of Old State Highway 79 not within Oak Creek Canyon	89
48. Old State Highway 79 at Lower End of Oak Creek Canyon	90
49. Segment of Old State Highway 79 in Middle Oak Creek Canyon	90
50. Some Important Historic Roads in Arizona	107
51. U.S. Highway 60 through the Salt River Canyon, circa 1940	108
52. Old State Highway 79 through Oak Creek Canyon, circa 1940	109
53. Catalina Highway, circa 1940	110

LIST OF POCKET MAPS

1. Map of Arizona, 1912
2. Best Roads of Arizona, circa 1925
3. Road Map of Arizona, 1939

FOREWORD

The fact that many Arizona roadways may be considered to be historic properties that warrant contemplation in planning is the primary reason why the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT), with funding provided by the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA), pursued a project to gather the history of road building in Arizona. The concern by both ADOT and FHWA about how to reasonably take the historic associations and characteristics of roadways into consideration in planning roadway construction, maintenance, and improvement projects remains even after the completion of this manuscript.

Since the initiation of this project, there has been an evolution of thinking by ADOT and the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) regarding what constitutes a reasonable approach to considering the historic preservation of in-use and abandoned historic roadways. At the outset, the approach was to carefully gather information and consider the possible historic associations of roadways in order to propose appropriate areas of significance for roadways. Once the areas of significance were identified for roadways, the characteristics worthy of preservation would have been identified and it would be possible to evaluate the integrity of road segments for specific projects. After areas of significance for roadways were proposed in early drafts of this roads history, it was immediately clear that there would be no agreement on the significance of roads among the authors, SHPO, ADOT, and the staff of other agencies and other researchers who reviewed the draft document. Without a consensus on the significance of roadways there would be no agreement on whether an individual segment retained integrity or whether the scope of a project would adversely impact a historic roadway.

The lack of a consensus on the significance of roadways did not mean that the value of a history of Arizona road building was not generally recognized. This history of road building revealed that roads can be considered “structures” as well as “networks” or “systems.” With the approach of the fiftieth anniversary of the Interstate Highway System, the systemic character of state highways was recognized and with it a desire to divert focus away from evaluating individual segments and to considering possible cumulative impacts on a highway system. This change occurred in conjunction with the emphasis at the federal level to combine environmental streamlining with stewardship. Streamlining the consideration of historic roads in planning is now occurring with the development of a programmatic approach to roads as networks or systems. ADOT, FHWA, and SHPO are now working together to develop a programmatic approach that de-emphasizes the need for assessment of integrity for individual road segments.

This history of Arizona roads was written as our perceptions and considerations of roads changed. Despite shifts in the current thinking, approaches to evaluating specific road segments were retained in this volume in the event they may be integrated as a part of the programmatic approach to considering roadways.

Owen Lindauer
William S. Collins

PREFACE

This overview is the result of a project that was conducted under a contract with the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) supported by Enhancement Funds from the Federal Highway Administration. The work began in 1996 under the direction of Richard M. Duarte, manager of the Environmental Planning Section; and Bettina H. Rosenberg, historic preservation coordinator; with Robert Gasser, historic preservation specialist managing the contract until he took another position within ADOT. Historic preservation specialist Owen Lindauer took the lead in working to complete the project, but he left ADOT for another job while revisions were still ongoing. By then Bettina had retired, and when Serelle Laine took over Bettina's job she worked to complete the study. Others who provided comments to ADOT on various drafts of this document include William Collins of the State Historic Preservation Office, consultants Lyle Stone and Pat Stein, and Michael Sullivan of the Tonto National Forest. The efforts of all the ADOT staff and other reviewers who helped shape and eventually complete this document are appreciated.

This overview is intended to relate the history of Arizona road building, particularly the state highway system, with the regulatory context of historic preservation. The original, optimistic goal was to write a historic context that would establish guidelines for consistently evaluating all historic vehicular roads throughout the state. That effort was to be completed in one year, and was to be followed by a Phase 2 inventory that would implement those procedures to identify, evaluate, and nominate many significant vehicular roads in Arizona to the National Register of Historic Places. As Phase 1 comes to a close some seven years later, that goal obviously was not achieved. There is some consolation in the recognition that it is not a simple task to develop a general consensus among the many parties interested in historic roads, and to date, no other state has had any significant degree of success.

Melissa Keane and J. Simon Bruder completed a draft of this document, with contributions by Kenneth M. Euge, in 1999. The draft document defined a series of historic contexts for evaluating the significance of roads in Arizona. The focus of the analysis was on the history of road building itself, rather than other historic themes to which roads may relate, such as roadside architecture, tourism, or development of agriculture and mining. The draft report concluded that many roads in the state have lost historic integrity because of the almost continual upgrading of the state's road network, and most others are undistinguished examples of a very common type—the two-lane bituminous highway. Agency reviewers concluded that the recommendations of the draft report, which emphasized preservation of only the “crown jewels” of Arizona's historic roads, were too narrow.

While ADOT staff contemplated what to do with the draft document, Ms. Keane and Ms. Bruder left URS, and completion of the document languished. ADOT arranged for an interagency meeting in 2001 to discuss historic roads. After the meeting, ADOT concluded that the draft report provided valuable historical perspective on road building in Arizona and the history of how the state highway system came to be built should be emphasized in a revised version of the report. ADOT acknowledged that future studies would have to take on the challenge of developing consensus among the various involved agencies about specific standards of practice for evaluating the National Register eligibility of Arizona's roads, and to work toward formal inventory and evaluation of historic-era roads managed by ADOT.

I then reorganized sections of the original draft and eliminated some sections that troubled reviewers. A revised draft was completed in June 2002 at a time when ADOT and the State Historic Preservation Office were forging a broader and more catholic strategy for addressing inventory, evaluation, and preservation of historic elements of the state highway network in compliance with Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. That strategy is based on the blanket conclusion that the Arizona state highway system, writ large, is eligible for the National Register, but most routine maintenance and

minor upgrade project will not adversely affect the historic quality of the road system. Efforts to avoid or mitigate adverse effects will be highly focused on elements of the system deemed most significant. Although the details of that strategy are still being developed, the strategy simultaneously makes parts of this document obsolete and confirms the original conclusions about historic road preservation priorities.

Because Ms. Keane and Ms. Bruder completed the research and writing of the original draft report, with contributions by Kenneth Euge, it is appropriate to credit them as authors of this revised overview. Neither Melissa nor Simon will agree with every revision I made, and they should not be held responsible for my alterations of their original work.

A.E. (Gene) Rogge

ABSTRACT

The historic overview of road building was developed to provide background information for identifying roads in Arizona worthy of preservation. Chapter 1 describes the motivation of the Arizona Department of Transportation (ADOT) for commissioning this overview, and discusses the historic preservation regulations that framed the approach. Chapter 2 briefly summarizes the political history and funding of road development in the United States, from the founding of the nation through the mid-twentieth century. Chapter 3 discusses the evolution of road-building technology. The history of road building in Arizona is discussed in Chapter 4, within a framework focusing on each of the four criteria for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. Chapter 5 presents case studies based on field reconnaissance of selected segments of five roads scattered across the state. Chapter 6 identifies some of the challenges of evaluating the National Register eligibility of Arizona's roads. Conclusions and recommendations are presented in Chapter 7.

The general perspective of this study might be characterized as "bottom up" because it sought to develop guidelines for dealing with individual roads or even just road segments within the context of consultations required by Section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act. Over the long time it took to complete the study, ADOT and the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO) turned to a more "top down" approach addressing the state highway system as a whole. The *Interim Procedures for the Treatment of Historic Roads* that ADOT, SHPO, and the Federal Highways Administration adopted in November 2002 to begin to implement this more programmatic strategy are briefly described in Chapter 7.

A series of maps of the state highway system in 1914, 1924, 1935, 1941, and 1946 are attached as Appendix A. Three maps of the state highway system dating from 1912, circa 1925, and 1939 are included as pocket maps. Appendix B is an annotated bibliography of 17 key references related to the history of roads, and Appendix C lists the more than 70 roads currently included in the National Register. Only one of these, a multiple property documentation form that provides a context for listing rural segments, urban segments, abandoned segments, and traveler-related facilities related to Route 66, includes any Arizona roads.

